

PRINSIP UTILITAS DALAM KEBIJAKAN WAJIB VAKSINASI COVID-19

Penulis :

Yudi Setiawan, S.H., M.H

Dr. Nanik Prasetyoningsih, S.H., M.H



CV. STRATA PERSADA ACADEMIA

PRINSIP UTILITAS

Dalam Kebijakan Wajib Vaksinasi Covid-19

Penulis:

Yudi Setiawan, S.H., M.H

Dr. Nanik Prasetyoningsih, S.H., M.H

Editor:

Zaid, S.M., M.H

Desain Cover:

Tim Creative

Tata Letak:

Katon Pratondo

Ukuran:

i - iv, 1- 61, uk: 15.5x23 cm

ISBN:

978-623-09-8305-4

Cetakan Pertama:

Januari 2024

Hak Cipta 2024, Pada Penulis

Hak Cipta Dilindungi Oleh Undang-Undang

Copyright © 2024

by CV. Strata Persada Academia

All Right Reserved

DILARANG KERAS MENERJEMAHKAN, MEMFOTOKOPI, ATAU
MEMPERBANYAK SEBAGIAN ATAU SELURUH ISI BUKU INI
TANPA IZIN TERTULIS DARI PENERBIT.

PENERBIT:

CV. Strata Persada Academia

Dusun 03, Rt. 022, Rw. 007, Lemahabang Kulon, Kec. Lemahabang
Kabupaten Cirebon, Provinsi Jawa Barat 45183

Website: www.stratapersada.com

Instagram: @stratapersada

Email: admin@stratapersada.com

KATA PENGANTAR PENULIS

Alhamdulillah kami mengucapkan puji syukur kepada Allah ta'ala, yang atas limpahan rahmat dan karunianya kami dapat menyelesaikan naskah buku ini yang kami beri judul "Prinsip Utilitas dalam Kebijakan Wajib Vaksinasi COVID-19" yang insya Allah dan semoga dapat memberikan manfaat kepada para pembaca.

Seiring dengan berjalannya waktu, dunia telah dihadapkan pada tantangan besar dalam bentuk pandemi global, yakni COVID-19. Dalam upaya mengendalikan penyebaran virus ini, kebijakan wajib vaksinasi telah menjadi salah satu langkah utama yang diambil oleh banyak negara, termasuk Indonesia. Buku ini, berjudul "Prinsip Utilitas dalam Kebijakan Wajib Vaksinasi COVID-19," mengajak pembaca untuk menjelajahi landasan prinsipil di balik kebijakan tersebut.

Prinsip utilitas, yang menekankan pada pencapaian kesejahteraan maksimal untuk sebanyak mungkin orang, menjadi pusat perbincangan dalam konteks kebijakan wajib vaksinasi. Melalui penelitian mendalam dan analisis kritis, buku ini bertujuan untuk menyajikan pemahaman yang mendalam tentang bagaimana kebijakan ini dapat dijustifikasi berdasarkan prinsip utilitas serta dampaknya terhadap masyarakat secara keseluruhan.

Dengan merinci berbagai macam aspek dan pertimbangan ilmiah di sekitar kebijakan wajib vaksinasi, buku ini diharapkan dapat memberikan wawasan yang berharga kepada pembaca. Pembahasan tidak hanya mencakup aspek kebijakan itu sendiri, tetapi juga menggali pandangan berbagai pihak yang terlibat, menciptakan legitimasi tentang penerapan kebijakan wajib vaksinasi COVID-19.

Penulis berharap agar buku ini tidak hanya menjadi sumber informasi, tetapi juga memicu refleksi dan diskusi yang lebih luas

tentang tanggung jawab bersama dalam menghadapi pandemi. Semoga, dengan melibatkan pembaca dalam refleksi kritis ini, kita dapat bersama-sama mencari solusi terbaik untuk mencapai keseimbangan antara kepentingan individu dan kepentingan bersama dalam melawan COVID-19.

Terima kasih atas ketertarikan Anda dalam membaca buku ini. Semoga perjalanan intelektual ini membawa pemahaman yang lebih dalam tentang prinsip utilitas dalam konteks kebijakan wajib vaksinasi COVID-19.

Yogyakarta, 27 Januari 2024

Yudi Setiawan

DAFTAR ISI

KATA PENGANTAR PENULIS.....	i
DAFTAR ISI.....	iii
BAB 1	1
PENDAHULUAN.....	1
BAB 2	6
TINJAUAN TENTANG VAKSIN DAN VAKSINASI.....	6
A. Tinjauan Tentang Vaksin.....	6
B. Tinjauan Tentang Vaksinasi	9
BAB 3	11
CORONAVIRUS DISEASE (COVID-19)	11
A. Tinjauan Tentang Virus Corona	11
B. Tinjauan Tentang COVID-19.....	13
C. Manifestasi COVID-19	16
D. COVID-19 sebagai Pandemi.....	17
E. Gejala dan Penanganan COVID-19	19
BAB 4	22
VAKSIN DAN VAKSINASI COVID-19	22
A. Tinjauan Tentang Vaksin COVID-19	22
B. Jenis-Jenis Vaksin COVID-19	26
C. Keefektifan Vaksinasi COVID-19	30
BAB 5	33
KEBIJAKAN WAJIB VAKSINASI COVID-19	33
A. Tinjauan Kebijakan Wajib Vaksinasi Covid-19	33
B. Pro Kontra Kebijakan Wajib Vaksinasi COVID-19	35

C. Pertimbangan Pemerintah Mewajibkan Vaksinasi COVID-19 di Indonesia	36
D. Legitimasi terhadap Kebijakan Wajib Vaksinasi Covid-19 di Indonesia	38
BAB 6	43
PRINSIP UTILITAS PADA KEBIJAKAN WAJIB VAKSINASI COVID-19 DI INDONESIA	43
A. Prinsip Utilitas.....	43
B. Penerapan Prinsip Utilitas dalam Merumuskan Kebijakan Wajib Vaksinasi COVID-19 di Indonesia	49
DAFTAR PUSTAKA.....	53

DAFTAR PUSTAKA

- Achat, Helen M., Joanne M. Stubbs, and Rakhi Mittal. "Australian Healthcare Workers and COVID-19 Vaccination: Is Mandating Now or for Future Variants Necessary?" *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Public Health* (December 13, 2021).
- Adamy, Aulina, and Hafnidar A. Rani. "An Evaluation of Community Satisfaction with the Government's COVID-19 Pandemic Response in Aceh, Indonesia." *International Journal of Disaster Risk Reduction* 69 (February 1, 2022): 102723.
- Agarwal, Krishna Mohan, Swati Mohapatra, Prairit Sharma, Shreya Sharma, Dinesh Bhatia, and Animesh Mishra. "Study and Overview of the Novel Corona Virus Disease (COVID-19)." *Sensors International* 1 (2020): 100037.
- Ahmed, Ammar, Muhammad Aqeel, and Naeem Aslam. "COVID-19 Health Crisis and Prevalence of Anxiety among Individuals of Various Age Groups: A Qualitative Study." *Journal of Mental Health Training, Education and Practice* 16, no. 1 (November 18, 2020): 58–66.
- Aini, Hafiz Muhammad, and Gunawan Widjaja. "Mandatory Coronavirus Disease-19 (Covid-19) Vaccination in Indonesia: Legal Aspect" 24, no. 1 (2021).
- Anorue, Luke Ifeanyi, Alphonsus Chukwuma Ugwu, Stanley Uzoamaka Ugboaja, Uzoma O. Nwabunze, Chinyere Christiana Ugwulor-Onyinyechi, and Chioma Njoku. "Communicating COVID-19 Vaccine Safety: Knowledge and Attitude Among Residents of South East, Nigeria." *Infection and drug resistance* 14 (2021): 3785–3794.
- Ariawan, Iwan, Jusril, Hafizah. "COVID-19 in Indonesia: Where Are We?" 52, no. 3 (July 2020): 193–195.
- Artiga-Sainz, Laura Margarita, Adrián Ibáñez-Navarro, Miguel Morante-Ruiz, Juan Sánchez-Verde Bilbao, Guido Rodríguez de Lema-Tapetado, Antonio Sarria-Santamera,

- and Manuel Quintana-Díaz. "Overview of Coronavirus Pandemic." In *Computational Approaches for Novel Therapeutic and Diagnostic Designing to Mitigate SARS-CoV-2 Infection*, 1–22. Elsevier, 2022.
- Beccia, Flavia, Maria Francesca Rossi, Carlotta Amantea, Leonardo Villani, Alessandra Daniele, Antonio Tumminello, Luna Aristei, et al. "COVID-19 Vaccination and Medical Liability: An International Perspective in 18 Countries." *Vaccines* 10, no. 8 (August 2022): 1275.
- Bhatia, Rajesh, and Priya Abraham. "COVID-19 Vaccines & Pandemic." *The Indian Journal of Medical Research* 153, no. 5–6 (May 2021): 517.
- Brice, Yardley, Larry Morgan, Maaida Kirmani, Maha Kirmani, and Mercy C. Udeh. "COVID-19 Vaccine Evolution and Beyond." *Neuroscience Insights* 18 (June 19, 2023).
- Burrell, Christopher J., Colin R. Howard, and Frederick A. Murphy. "Coronaviruses." In *Fenner and White's Medical Virology*, 437–446. Elsevier, 2017.
- Cheng, F.K. "Debate on Mandatory COVID-19 Vaccination." *Ethics, Medicine and Public Health* 21 (April 2022): 100761.
- Chirumbolo, Salvatore. "Vaccination Hesitancy and the 'Myth' on mRNA-Based Vaccines in Italy in the COVID-19 Era: Does Urgency Meet Major Safety Criteria?" *Journal of Medical Virology* 93, no. 7 (July 1, 2021): 4049–4053.
- Ciski, K., Juan Manuel Gorriz, Yudong Zhang, Krzysztof Rz, , Asa, and Mateusz Ciski. "Influence of the Demographic, Social, and Environmental Factors on the COVID-19 Pandemic—Analysis of the Local Variations Using Geographically Weighted Regression." *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 2022, Vol. 19, Page 11881 19, no. 19 (September 2022): 11881.
- Cohen, Adam F., Joop van Gerven, Juan Garcia Burgos, Anthonius de Boer, Ron A.M. Foucher, H. Flore, Zvi Teitelbaum, Willem van Eden, Andrew Webb, and Serge Cremers. "COVID-19 Vaccines: The Importance of Transparency and Fact-Based Education." *British Journal of*

- Clinical Pharmacology* 86, no. 11 (November 1, 2020): 2107–2110.
- Edwards-Jones, Valerie. "Alternative Antimicrobial Approaches to Fighting Multidrug-Resistant Infections." In *Fighting Multidrug Resistance with Herbal Extracts, Essential Oils and Their Components*, edited by Mahendra Kumar Rai and Kateryna Volodymyrivna Kon, 1–9. Elsevier, 2013.
- Erawan, M. Aufar Saputra Pratama, Zaid Zaid, and Muhammad Oky Fauzi. "Does the Discourse on the Increase of Value Added Tax Have Any Legitimacy? Utilitarian Point of View." *International Journal of Social Science and Business* 5, no. 3 (July 25, 2021): 340–345.
- Feeley, Malcolm M. "The Costs of Accidents: A Legal and Economic Analysis. By Guido Calabresi (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1970. Pp. 340. 4.50, Paper.)." *American Political Science Review* 67, no. 4 (December 1973): 1352–1353.
- Finsterer, Josef, Fulvio A. Scorza, Carla A. Scorza, and Ana C. Fiorini. "Extrapulmonary Onset Manifestations of COVID-19." *Clinics* 76 (2021): e2900.
- Hanifah, Salma Nur, and Darmanto Hartono Paulus. "Analisis Yuridis Kebijakan Pemerintah Dalam Membangkitkan Ekonomi Nasional Dampak Covid-19 | Hanifah | Jurnal Pembangunan Hukum Indonesia." *Jurnal Pembangunan Hukum Indonesia* 4, no. 1 (2022): 34–48.
- Hayman, Benoit, Rajinder Kumar Suri, and Matthew Downham. "Sustainable Vaccine Manufacturing in Low- and Middle-Income Countries." *Vaccine* (November 2022): 1.
- Hoşgelen, Emine Ilgın, and Köksal Alptekin. "The Impact of the COVID-19 Pandemic on Schizophrenia Patients." *Türk Psikiyatri Dergisi* 32, no. 3 (2021): 219–221.
- Hunt, Paul. "Interpreting the International Right to Health in a Human Rights-Based Approach to Health." *Health and Human Rights* 18, no. 2 (December 2016): 109.
- Hunter, Robert L. "Overview of Vaccine Adjuvants: Present and Future." *Vaccine* 20 (May 2002): S7–S12.
- Juen, Christina-Marie, Michael Jankowski, Robert A. Huber,

- Torren Frank, Leena Maaß, and Markus Tepe. "Who Wants COVID-19 Vaccination to Be Compulsory? The Impact of Party Cues, Left-Right Ideology, and Populism." *Politics* 43, no. 3 (August 14, 2023): 330–350.
- Khan, Maria, Haris Khan, Shehriyar Khan, and Maimoona Nawaz. "Epidemiological and Clinical Characteristics of Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) Cases at a Screening Clinic during the Early Outbreak Period: A Single-Centre Study." *Journal of medical microbiology* 69, no. 8 (2020): 1114–1123.
- Khoury, Charles, Ayoub Larabi, Pierre Verger, Fatima Gauna, Jean Luc Cracowski, and Jeremy Ward. "Impact of Vaccine Hesitancy on Onset, Severity and Type of Self-Reported Adverse Events: A French Cross-Sectional Survey." *Drug safety* (2022).
- Korsman, Stephen N.J., Gert U. van Zyl, Louise Nutt, Monique I. Andersson, and Wolfgang Preiser. "Human Coronaviruses." In *Virology*, 94–95. Elsevier, 2012.
- Kudlay, Dmitry, and Andrey Svistunov. "COVID-19 Vaccines: An Overview of Different Platforms." *Bioengineering* 9, no. 2 (February 1, 2022).
- Levin, Todd P., and Nikunj Vyas. "COVID-19 Clinical Manifestations." In *COVID-19 Viral Sepsis*, 115–127. Elsevier, 2023.
- Lin, Cheryl, Pikuei Tu, and Leslie M. Beitsch. "Confidence and Receptivity for COVID-19 Vaccines: A Rapid Systematic Review." *Vaccines* 9, no. 1 (December 30, 2020): 16.
- Lippi, Giuseppe, Fabian Sanchis-Gomar, Camilla Mattiuzzi, and Brandon M. Henry. "SARS-CoV-2: An Update on the Biological Interplay with the Human Host." *COVID 2023, Vol. 3, Pages 1586-1600* 3, no. 10 (October 10, 2023): 1586–1600.
- Liu, Yen Chin, Rei Lin Kuo, and Shin Ru Shih. "COVID-19: The First Documented Coronavirus Pandemic in History." *Biomedical Journal* 43, no. 4 (August 1, 2020): 328–333.
- Logrieco, Maria Grazia Mada, Giuseppe Logrieco, Ilaria Nicoli, Francesca Pignatelli, Francesca Lionetti, Francesco Traglia,

- Maria Spinelli, Alberto Di Domenico, and Mirco Fasolo. "How Were Healthcare Workers after Anti-SARS-CoV-2 Vaccination? A Study of the Emotional Side Effects of Vaccination." *Vaccines* 10, no. 6 (June 2022).
- Lopez, Santiago M.C., Alice I. Sato, and Archana Chatterjee. "Vaccines: An Overview." In *Viral, Parasitic, Bacterial, and Fungal Infections*, edited by Debasis Bagchi, Amitava Das, and Bernard William Downs, 699–717. Elsevier, 2023.
- McCoy, Charles Allan. "Adapting Coercion: How Three Industrialized Nations Manufacture Vaccination Compliance." *Journal of health politics, policy and law* 44, no. 6 (2019): 823–854.
- Moghadas, Seyed M, Thomas N Vilches, Kevin Zhang, Chad R Wells, Affan Shoukat, Burton H Singer, Lauren Ancel Meyers, et al. "The Impact of Vaccination on Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Outbreaks in the United States." *Clinical Infectious Diseases* 73, no. 12 (December 16, 2021): 2257–2264.
- Najafi, Saeideh, Salar Tofighi, and Juliana Sobczyk. "COVID-19: Virology." In *Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19)*, edited by Ali Gholamrezanezhad and Michael P. Dube, 22–33. Wiley, 2023.
- Ndwandwe, Duduzile, and Charles S. Wiysonge. "COVID-19 Vaccines." *Current Opinion in Immunology* 71 (August 1, 2021): 111–116.
- Nikolouzakis, Taxiarchis Konstantinos, Daniela Calina, Benjamin Brooks, Anca Docea, and Aristides Tsatsakis. "A Critical Appraisal of the Toxicological Aspects of COVID-19 and Its Vaccines." In *Encyclopedia of Toxicology*, 1–11. Elsevier, 2024.
- Nugraha, Boya, KurniaNuh Wahyuni, Hening Laswati, Peni Kusumastuti, Bm Angela Tulaar, and Christoph Gutenbrunner. "COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia: Situation and Challenges of Rehabilitation Medicine in Indonesia - PubMed." *Acta Medica Indonesiana* 52, no. 3 (2020): 299–305.
- Ouassou, Hayat, Loubna Kharchoufa, Mohamed Bouhrim, Nour

- Elhouda Daoudi, Hamada Imtara, Nouredine Bencheikh, Amine Elbouzidi, and Mohamed Bnouham. "The Pathogenesis of Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19): Evaluation and Prevention." *Journal of Immunology Research* 2020 (2020).
- Padda, Inderbir S., and Mayur Parmar. "COVID (SARS-CoV-2) Vaccine." *StatPearls* (June 3, 2023).
- Patel, Manish M., and Umesh D. Parashar. "Assessing the Effectiveness and Public Health Impact of Rotavirus Vaccines after Introduction in Immunization Programs." *The Journal of infectious diseases* 200 Suppl, no. SUPPL. 1 (November 2009): 1.
- Paudel, Shishir, Ganesh Dangal, Anisha Chalise, Tulsi Ram Bhandari, and Ojash Dangal. "The Coronavirus Pandemic: What Does the Evidence Show?" *Journal of Nepal Health Research Council* 18, no. 1 (April 2020): 1–9.
- Pawlowski, Colin, Patrick Lenahan, Arjun Puranik, Vineet Agarwal, A.J. Venkatakrishnan, Michiel J.M. Niesen, John C. O'Horo, et al. "FDA-Authorized mRNA COVID-19 Vaccines Are Effective per Real-World Evidence Synthesized across a Multi-State Health System." *Med* 2, no. 8 (August 2021): 979-992.e8.
- Polatoğlu, Ilker, Tulay Oncu-Oner, Irem Dalman, and Senanur Ozdogan. "COVID-19 in Early 2023: Structure, Replication Mechanism, Variants of SARS-CoV-2, Diagnostic Tests, and Vaccine & Drug Development Studies." *MedComm* 4, no. 2 (April 8, 2023).
- Prasetyoningsih, Nanik, Zaid Zaid, Wempy Setyabudi Hernowo, and Faishal Hilmy. "State Obligation in Fulfilling the Right to Health through the Mandatory COVID-19 Vaccination." *Indonesian Journal of Law and Society* 3, no. 2 (March 7, 2023): 195.
- Qian, Xu, Ran Ren, Youfa Wang, Yan Guo, Jing Fang, Zhong Dao Wu, Pei Long Liu, and Tie Ru Han. "Fighting against the Common Enemy of COVID-19: A Practice of Building a Community with a Shared Future for Mankind." *Infectious*

diseases of poverty 9, no. 1 (April 2020).

Rahman, Md. Mijanur, Md. Habib Ullah Masum, Shah Wajed, and Asma Talukder. "A Comprehensive Review on COVID-19 Vaccines: Development, Effectiveness, Adverse Effects, Distribution and Challenges." *VirusDisease* 33, no. 1 (March 1, 2022): 1–22.

Rahman, Md Mijanur, Md Habib Ullah Masum, Shah Wajed, and Asma Talukder. "A Comprehensive Review on COVID-19 Vaccines: Development, Effectiveness, Adverse Effects, Distribution and Challenges." *VirusDisease* 33, no. 1 (March 1, 2022): 1.

Saragih, Herlina J. R., Hermawan Saputra, Oskar Vitriano, and Nadilah Salma. "Health System Resilience in The Context of COVID-19 Vaccination Management in Indonesia." *Media Kesehatan Masyarakat Indonesia* 8, no. August (2022): 81–92.

Saturwa, Henry Nosih, Suharno Suharno, and Abdul Aziz Ahmad. "The Impact of Covid-19 Pandemic on MSMEs." *Jurnal Ekonomi dan Bisnis* 24, no. 1 (2021): 65–82.

Setiawan, Yudi, Zaid Zaid, Nanik Prasetyoningsih, and Mahbub Pasca Al Bahy. "A Libertarian Legitimacy for Mandatory Covid-19 Vaccination." *Jurnal Media Hukum* 29, no. 2 (October 14, 2022): 94–106.

Sharma, Atul, Swapnil Tiwari, Manas Kanti Deb, and Jean Louis Marty. "Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus-2 (SARS-CoV-2): A Global Pandemic and Treatment Strategies." *International journal of antimicrobial agents* 56, no. 2 (August 2020): 106054.

Sprengholz, Philipp, Cornelia Betsch, and Robert Böhm. "Reactance Revisited: Consequences of Mandatory and Scarce Vaccination in the Case of COVID-19." *Applied Psychology: Health and Well-Being* 13, no. 4 (November 1, 2021): 986–995.

Tannous, Jonika, Alan P Pan, Thomas Potter, Abdulaziz T Bako, Katharine Dlouhy, Ashley Drews, Henry Dirk Sostman, and Farhaan S Vahidy. "Real-World Effectiveness of COVID-19 Vaccines and Anti-SARS-CoV-2 Monoclonal Antibodies

- against Postacute Sequelae of SARS-CoV-2: Analysis of a COVID-19 Observational Registry for a Diverse US Metropolitan Population." *BMJ Open* 13, no. 4 (April 5, 2023): e067611.
- Tavilani, Alireza, Ebrahim Abbasi, Farhad Kian Ara, Ali Darini, and Zahra Asefy. "COVID-19 Vaccines: Current Evidence and Considerations." *Metabolism Open* 12 (December 2021): 100124.
- — —. "COVID-19 Vaccines: Current Evidence and Considerations." *Metabolism Open* 12 (December 1, 2021): 100124.
- Turbat, Battsetseg, Bold Sharavyn, and Feng Jen Tsai. "Attitudes towards Mandatory Occupational Vaccination and Intention to Get COVID-19 Vaccine during the First Pandemic Wave among Mongolian Healthcare Workers: A Cross-Sectional Survey." *International journal of environmental research and public health* 19, no. 1 (January 2021).
- Vyas, Navya, Prakash Narayanan Vasudevan Potty, Shashidhar Vishwanath, and Sheikh Shah Hossain. "An Overview of COVID-19: An Emerging Infectious Disease." In *Viral, Parasitic, Bacterial, and Fungal Infections*, edited by Bagachi Debasis, Amitava Das, and Bernard William Downs, 223–236. Elsevier, 2023.
- Widjaja, Gunawan. "COVID-19 Pandemic and Law No. 6 Year 2018 Regarding Health Quarantine." *Journal of Indonesian Health Policy and Administration* 5, no. 2 (May 2020).
- Xin, Xing, Shu fang Li, Ling Cheng, Chang yu Liu, Yin juan Xin, Hai long Huang, Rajluxmee Beejadhursing, Shao shuai Wang, and Ling Feng. "Government Intervention Measures Effectively Control COVID-19 Epidemic in Wuhan, China." *Current medical science* 41, no. 1 (February 2021): 77–83.
- Yadav, Dinesh K., Neelam Yadav, and Satyendra Mohan Paul Khurana. "Vaccines." In *Animal Biotechnology*, edited by Ashish S. Verma and Anchal Singh, 491–508. Elsevier, 2014.
- Zaid, Zaid, Wempy Setyabudi Hernowo, and Nanik Prasetyoningsih. "Mandatory COVID-19 Vaccination in

Human Rights and Utilitarianism Perspectives.” *International Journal of Public Health Science (IJPHS)* 11, no. 3 (September 2022): 967.

Zerbe, Richard O. “Cost-Benefit Analysis in Legal Decision-Making.” In *The Oxford Handbook of Law and Economics: Volume 1: Methodology and Concepts* *The Oxford Handbook of Law and Economics: Volume 1: Methodology and Concepts* Francesco Parisi, edited by Francesco Parisi, 1:355–380. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017.

Zheng, Caifang, Weihao Shao, Xiaorui Chen, Bowen Zhang, Gaili Wang, and Weidong Zhang. “Real-World Effectiveness of COVID-19 Vaccines: A Literature Review and Meta-Analysis.” *International Journal of Infectious Diseases* 114 (January 2022): 252–260.